

***El Cerrito Draft Climate Action Plan  
Public Comment and Responses  
April 9, 2013***

**Summary of Changes Made to the *Climate Action Plan***

Based on public comment received during the public review period of February 12 through March 15, 2013, the following have been included in the Final Climate Action Plan.

**Executive Summary**

Page IX: Footnote added to define green house gas emissions:

“Gases that trap heat in the atmosphere are called greenhouse gases. While there are many natural sources of greenhouse gases, the burning of fossil fuels- such as coal, natural gas, and oil - is a common man-made source of greenhouse gases.”

Page IX: Footnote added to describe Assembly Bill 32:

“AB 32, signed by Governor Schwarzenegger in 2006, requires California to reduce statewide GHG emissions to 1990 levels by 2020.”

**Chapter 1: Climate Change in Context**

Page 3: Footnote added to define “tiering”:

“Tiering under CEQA typically refers to the analysis of broad environmental issues associated with development under a plan, program, or ordinance in a program EIR and the subsequent preparation of more narrowly focused individual project EIRs.”

Page 8: Existing footnote added to text to emphasize consumer cost savings. Error in cost savings corrected:

“In 2005, El Cerritans spent approximately \$48.6 million on energy, fuel, water, and waste disposal. If each household reduced their use of these commodities just 15%, they would have another \$700 per year of disposable income.”

**Chapter 2: El Cerrito’s GHG Emissions**

Page 16: Statistics for “Population” and “Tons CO2e per Capita” added to Figure 2.5 “GHG Forecast and Reduction Targets.”

**Chapter 3: Community Climate Action Strategies**

*Land Use, Transportation, and Community Development*

Page 21: Underlined text added to list of “Climate Actions Since 2005”:

“Worked with El Cerrito Trail Trekkers towards restoring the City’s network of public paths and trails.”

- Page 26: To make more legible, *Figure 3.1, Del Norte BART Station* repeated in larger form to *Appendix K: Home Location of BART Riders by Mode.*
- Page 27: Underlined text added to strategy under Objective SC-2.1:  
“Link the City’s main commercial nodes through a network of open space, public art, and other cultural, historic amenities that encourage people to linger longer.”
- Page 28: Underlined text added to Objective SC-2.2:  
“Enhance neighborhood-serving commercial nodes and encourage the development of commercial spaces in mixed-use areas that can better serve the daily needs of residents, businesses, and people who work in El Cerrito.”
- Page 30: Underlined text added to strategy under Objective SC-3.2:  
“Develop a wayfinding signage program to promote use of pedestrian trails and stairs, including as a way to improve pedestrian access to schools and transit.”
- Page 30: Underlined text added under Objective SC-3.3:  
“The Ohlone Greenway Master Plan, adopted in 2009, sets forth the vision of how the Ohlone Greenway will evolve and develop over time, provides design guidelines, and prioritizes public improvements to maximize the public’s safety, use, and enjoyment of this major pedestrian and bicycle path connecting the entire length of the City.”
- Page 31: Underlined text added to Objective SC-3.4:  
“Expand and improve the City’s transit, bicycle, pedestrian, and zero-emissions vehicle infrastructure.”  
“The City received funding in 2012 to update the Bicycle and Pedestrian Circulation Plan (Bike/Ped Plan), which is anticipated to be complete in 2014. During the community input process for the CAP, participants provided the following suggestions for improving El Cerrito’s bicycle and pedestrian infrastructure, which will be reviewed as part of the Bike/Ped Plan update:”
- Underlined text added to descriptor under Objective SC-3.4:  
“Develop strategies for facilitating greater bike/ pedestrian connections between transit facilities along San Pablo Avenue and the hillside neighborhoods, such as encouraging casual carpool sites, an electric “zoo train” or funicular on major east-west corridors, such as Moeser Avenue.”
- Underlined text added to strategy under Objective SC-3.4:

“Work in conjunction with regional efforts to support the development of electric vehicle charging stations in appropriate locations throughout El Cerrito.”

Page 32: Underlined text added to Objective SC-3.5:  
“Collaborate with the West Contra Costa Transportation Advisory Committee (WCCTAC), BART, AC Transit, WestCAT, major employers, and schools to support improvements and greater access to transit facilities throughout El Cerrito.”

Underlined text added and strikethrough text deleted to strategies under Objective SC-3.5:

“Seek grant opportunities to implement improvements identified in the West County Transportation Enhancement and Transit Wayfinding Projects and to fund pilot projects that increase access to transit.”

“Work with WCCTAC, 511 Contra Costa, employers, ~~shopping centers, and schools~~ in El Cerrito and nearby communities (such as Berkeley National Lab’s new Richmond Field Campus) to develop commuter trip reduction programs to decrease single-occupant vehicle use in El Cerrito’s transit, commercial, and educational centers. ~~parking in and around the BART stations in El Cerrito.~~”

“Identify and help mitigate barriers, such as lack of access to high speed broadband in business centers, to employers being able to use high tech solutions, such as video conferencing, to cut down on business travel.”

Page 35: Underlined text added to Objective SC-4.2:  
“Promote Bay-Friendly tree planting and landscaping, and the creation of green and open space that is attractive and helps restore natural processes, sequester carbon, clean storm water, conserve resources, and connect citizens to El Cerrito’s natural environment.”

Underlined text added as a strategy under Objective SC-4.2:

“Seek funding to increase the urban forest through a variety of programs, including a street tree planting and stewardship program.”

Page 36: Underlined text added as a strategy under Objective SC-5.2:  
“Promote organized hiking events to increase use and awareness of the City’s pedestrian paths and trail network.”

### **Chapter 3: Community Climate Action Strategies**

#### *Energy and Water*

Page 46: Underlined text added as strategies under Objective EW-4.2:  
“Seek grant opportunities to provide incentives for water conservation strategies.”  
“Work with East Bay Municipal Utility District to bring recycled water to El Cerrito.”

### Chapter 3: Municipal Climate Action Strategies

Page 56: Underlined text added to descriptor under Municipal Goal #1:  
 “In addition, City employee commutes to and from work, resulting in a significant amount of vehicle miles traveled (VMT), are the 3rd largest source of GHG emissions associated with municipal operations.”

**Appendices:**

Pages 32-50 Updated “Appendix G: Summary of Goals, Objectives, and Strategies” to include all changes to strategies and objectives described above.

Page 63: Added “Appendix K: Home Location of BART Riders by Mode”

### Response to Other Public Comments Received

Comment	Response
<b>General</b>	
Are the GHG emission reduction targets ambitious enough given the scale of the problem?	These reduction targets were adopted by the City Council in 2011 and can be revised by Council. Due to El Cerrito’s residential nature where the majority of emissions come from 10’s of 1,000’s of individual decision makers, these targets are ambitious. Instead of focusing on a relatively few large sources, El Cerrito’s success in reaching these targets will need to come from the many small, aggregated actions taken by its residents and businesses, which will require significant education and outreach.
Do we have enough buffer identified in the Plan to achieve our reduction targets if all the strategies are not fully implemented?	During the monitoring process, we will be able to monitor progress towards the reduction targets. During updates to the Plan, new actions can be added, especially as new funding, programs and technologies become available.
The CAP should have a more explicit implementation timeline and indicators or metrics that the City and public can use to measure progress over time.	<p>Given the changing nature of funding opportunities and access to resources and programs that can help implement the CAP, prioritization of actions for implementation is more appropriate as part of the annual CAP Implementation Report, as discussed in the “Monitoring and Continuous Improvement” section of <i>Chapter 6, Implementation</i>.</p> <p>The City is currently developing progress indicators in conjunction with the STAR (Sustainability Tools for Assessing and Rating) Communities Index, a national consensus-based framework for gauging the sustainability and livability of US communities. Climate, energy, transportation, and community health indicators are being developed as part of this process.</p>
The premise of developing a Climate Action Plan is faulty because human caused climate change and global warming is a	The CAP was developed as part of a long-term, open public process that has engaged hundreds of citizens, the vast majority of whom believe, when surveyed, that climate change is a serious problem requiring action.

lie.	
The CAP should include actions responding to sea level rise, wildfire, structural fire, public health, and include other “adaptations” to make El Cerrito more resilient to the impacts of climate change.	While there is a discussion of the effects of climate change on El Cerrito (beginning on page 5) and a preliminary list of issues and strategies (page 52), “adaptation” planning is beyond the scope of the current CAP. Because adaptation planning intersects with infrastructure improvements and emergency preparedness, it should be undertaken in conjunction with updating the General Plan and the Local Hazards Mitigation Plan.
<b>Land Use, Transportation, and Community Development</b>	
<i>Increase Allowable Densities Not Just Along San Pablo Avenue:</i> Several comments suggested also increasing allowable densities beyond the San Pablo Avenue Corridor and also allowing more neighborhood serving businesses in neighborhoods.	These suggestions were not included for the primary reason that the CAP should not be inconsistent with the El Cerrito General Plan, which currently seeks to preserve the existing nature of residential neighborhoods. The more appropriate time to consider these suggestions is during an update to the General Plan.
The CAP should add historic preservation as a way to ensure that El Cerrito retains its sense of place to increase pedestrian activity.	While historic preservation may be a place making strategy, it is not explicitly a GHG reduction strategy and is tangential to the scope of the CAP.
<b>Energy and Water</b>	
<i>Provide Incentives for Energy and Water Savings:</i> Multiple comments requested the City provide incentives for home energy reports and the installation of resource conserving technologies such as solar electric and hot water systems, rain barrels, laundry-to-garden gray water kits, and energy efficiency upgrades.	These suggestions were not explicitly incorporated into the CAP because they fall under existing strategies as possible program elements in the design of any of the public outreach and education programs. Availability of any incentives would be contingent on assistance from available outside resources, such as grants.
<i>Develop ordinances requiring energy performance reports and/or energy efficiency improvements at time-of-sale or lease:</i> Multiple comments suggested the development of ordinances that would require either disclosure or improvements at Time-of-Sale for both residential and commercial property.	These approaches are investigated as possible avenues of action under “EW-1.3: Utilize existing points of interaction with the City to encourage and/or require cost-effective energy and water efficiency improvements.” However, as stated on page 39, participants in the CAP public workshops preferred education and incentives to reach our goals, with the option of using a more regulatory approach at later phases, if voluntary measures fell short.  For commercial properties, disclosure of the energy performance of a building at time-of-sale or lease is already mandate by Assembly Bill 1103, see page 41 of the CAP.
Allow retroactive rewards/incentives back to 2005 for	Most, if not all, incentive programs are designed to encourage new participation. Incentives for energy and water

upgrades and reductions.	efficiency will most likely be available through grants or utility funds, which explicitly prohibit retroactive rewards.
Ban leaf-blowers and other tools using fossil-fuel powered 2-stroke engines.	Fuel consumption and emissions from this type of equipment is not easily measured or monitored and was not included in the CAP's baseline inventory. In addition, such a ban was never discussed during the CAP public input process. It is therefore currently not included as a GHG reduction measure. However, in future updates of the CAP, regulation of these sources of pollution could be investigated. As is the case with the development of any policy item, a ban would need to go through its own planning and public review process.
<b>Waste</b>	
Require landlords to provide GHG and recycling information to tenants.	It is mandatory in California for all multi-family buildings with more than 5 units to provide recycling services. As part of implementing that law, the City has conducted outreach to the owners and managers of these properties and has provided recycling information.
Provide incentives to homeowners, tenants, landlords, and trash company to support infrequent smaller trash loads.	The Franchise Agreement with East Bay Sanitary, Company - and the rates it charges to homeowners, tenants and landlords – currently provides incentives to support infrequent collection of small trash containers. The City Council has given policy direction to maintain the current incentive structure in the future.
Provide a Tool-Lending Library	This could be a possible avenue of implementation as part of the Zero-Waste Plan mentioned on page 51 and would be investigated as part of that strategy.